

DRAFT

RFP PD 17 07
Citywide Towing Services

CITY OF PEMBROKE PINES, FL
EVALUATION COMMITTEE

March 15, 2018

The meeting of the Evaluation Committee ("Committee") for RFP PD 17 07 "Citywide Towing Services" was called to order by Gabriel Fernandez at 10:03 A.M. on Thursday, March 15, 2018, in the Conference Room of the Engineering Division, Public Services, 8300 South Palm Drive, Pembroke Pines, Florida, 33025.

Present to wit: Evaluation Committee: Members Carlos Bermudez, Steven Buckland, and Lisa Chong. Also Present: Gabriel Fernandez, Assistant Purchasing Manager; Assistant City Attorney Brian Sherman; and Board Secretary Katherine Borgstrom.

Gabriel Fernandez, Assistant Purchasing Manager, presented the purpose of the meeting, which is for the Committee to publicly review and rank proposals. The committee will be asked to consider each vendor according to the criteria provided in their package and score the proposals according to the percentage allotment afforded to each criteria. The committee will finalize their scores. The City Clerk will tally each evaluator's score card and rank the score cards according to the total scores. The end result will be a final ranking by each member of all vendors listed and no ties on the individual evaluators score cards. The rankings will be read aloud and the Evaluation Committee will then be asked to recommend to the City Commission award the contract to the highest ranked vendor.

DRAFT

A motion by Member Buckland, seconded by Member Chong, to nominate Member Bermudez to serve as Chairman, passed unanimously.

Chairman Bermudez called for questions or discussion. Chairman Bermudez inquired on the length of time A & B Towing Service had worked with the City and the proposal stated the length of time to be over twenty years. Member Chong asked the attorney if the members could speak to the vendors present to ask a question, or could they request a second meeting to have presentations. Assistant City Attorney Sherman stated that the members could not speak to the vendors today, that if the Committee desired to have interaction with vendors, a second meeting would have to be scheduled for presentations from the vendors and questions to vendors from the Committee and then the scoring would take place. Chairman Bermudez and Member Buckland stated they were ready to make a determination today and did not require a presentation from the vendors. By consensus the members began scoring the vendors at 10:07 A.M.

The Secretary entered the scoring and finalized the ranking. Gabriel Fernandez read the results of the scoring as:

Company	Score	Rank
A & B Towing Service	4	1
WestWay Towing, Inc.	5	2

A motion by Member Buckland, seconded by Member Chong to approve the scoring as read and to recommend to the Commission the award of contract to A & B Towing Service, passed unanimously.

DRAFT

Chairman Bermudez and Member Buckland stated their reasons for their scoring of the vendors.

Chairman Bermudez adjourned the meeting at 10:17 A.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Katherine Borgstrom
Board Secretary

Summary of All Scores

PD-17-07

"Citywide Towing Services"

Evaluation Committee Score Sheet

Thursday, March 15, 2018

Evaluator/Vendor		Carlos Bermudez	Steve Buckland	Lisa Chong	Total	Rank
1	A & B Towing Service	1	1	2	4	1
2	WestWay Towing, Inc.	2	2	1	5	2

Certifier of Score

Katherine Borgstrom

Please Print Name

Kathia Borgstrom

Signature

3/15/2018

Date

"Citywide Towing Services"

Evaluator Score Sheet
March 15, 2018

Instructions:

Each Evaluator is provided with the following information to assist with evaluating the proposals

- 1) RFP # PD-17-07 " Citywide Towing Services"
- 2) Bid Tabulation/Listing Sheet
- 3) Proposals from each firm

Each Evaluator is asked to evaluate each firm using the information provided and the following weighted criteria which is also provided in detail in the RFP.

- 1) Qualifications and Capability to Provide Services 35%
- 2) Previous Experience 10%
- 3) Proposed Franchise Fee 50%
- 4) Local Vendor Preference/ Veteran Owned Small Business Preference 5%

The Evaluation Committee will have an opportunity to discuss the firm's proposal. Once the Committee has completed the discussion on the individual the firm, the committee will be asked to take into consideration the criteria listed above and score the proposal according to the percentage allotment afforded to each criteria. See example below. This step will take place for each of the firms. Once all firms have been reviewed, the committee will be given time to finalize their scores for each of the firms. Once the score cards are complete, the City Clerk will tally each evaluator's score card. For each evaluator's score card, the total scores will then be ranked 1-2 with the highest score receiving a 1 and the lowest score receiving a 2. In the event of a tie. The Evaluator will be asked to break the tie and rank the tied vendors according to his interpretation of the information provided to him. The end result will be a separate ranking by each evaluator for all firms listed; no ties on the individual evaluator score cards. Once the scores have been read, an evaluating member of the committee must make a motion, which must be approved by majority vote of the committee.

Evaluation Criteria

	Vendor Name	Qualifications and Capability to Provide Services	Previous Experience	Proposed Franchise Fee	Local Vendor Preference/ Veteran Owned Small Business Preference	Total	Rank	Comments
		Maximum 35%	Maximum 10%	Maximum 50%	Maximum 5%	Maximum 100%		
	Sample	30%	5%	40%	5%	80%	(1-2)	
1	A & B Towing Service	35%	10%	50%	2.5%	97.5%	1	
2	WestWay Towing, Inc.	35%	10%	45%	2.5%	92.5%	2	

Certifier of Score

STEVEN P. BUCKLAND

Please Print Name

Date

3-15-18



Signature

"Citywide Towing Services"

Evaluator Score Sheet
March 15, 2018

Instructions:

Each /Evaluator is provided with the following information to assist with evaluating the proposals

- 1) RFP # PD-17-07 " Citywide Towing Services"
- 2) Bid Tabulation/Listing Sheet
- 3) Proposals from each firm

Each Evaluator is asked to evaluate each firm using the information provided and the following weighted criteria which is also provided in detail in the RFP.

- 1) Qualifications and Capability to Provide Services 35%
- 2) Previous Experience 10%
- 3) Proposed Franchise Fee 50%
- 4) Local Vendor Preference/ Veteran Owned Small Business Preference 5%

The Evaluation Committee will have an opportunity to discuss the firm's proposal. Once the Committee has completed the discussion on the individual the firm, the committee will be asked to take into consideration the criteria listed above and score the proposal according to the percentage allotment afforded to each criteria. See example below. This step will take place for each of the firms. Once all firms have been reviewed, the committee will be given time to finalize their scores for each of the firms. Once the score cards are complete, the City Clerk will tally each evaluator's score card. For each evaluator's score card, the total scores will then be ranked 1-2 with the highest score receiving a 1 and the lowest score receiving a 2. In the event of a tie. The Evaluator will be asked to break the tie and rank the tied vendors according to his interpretation of the information provided to him. The end result will be a separate ranking by each evaluator for all firms listed; no ties on the individual evaluator score cards. Once the scores have been read, an evaluating member of the committee must make a motion, which must be approved by majority vote of the committee.

Evaluation Criteria

	Vendor Name	Qualifications and Capability to Provide Services	Previous Experience	Proposed Franchise Fee	Local Vendor Preference/ Veteran Owned Small Business Preference	Total	Rank	Comments
		Maximum 35%	Maximum 10%	Maximum 50%	Maximum 5%	Maximum 100%		
	Sample	30%	5%	40%	5%	80%	(1-2)	
1	A & B Towing Service	35%	10%	50%	2.5%	97.5%	1	
2	WestWay Towing, Inc.	25%	5%	40%	2.5%	72.5%	2	

Certifier of Score

Charles J. Edwards 03/15/18
Please Print Name Date

[Signature]
Signature

"Citywide Towing Services"

Evaluator Score Sheet
March 15, 2018

Instructions:

Each Evaluator is provided with the following information to assist with evaluating the proposals

- 1) RFP # PD-17-07 "Citywide Towing Services"
- 2) Bid Tabulation/Listing Sheet
- 3) Proposals from each firm

Each Evaluator is asked to evaluate each firm using the information provided and the following weighted criteria which is also provided in detail in the RFP.

- 1) Qualifications and Capability to Provide Services 35%
- 2) Previous Experience 10%
- 3) Proposed Franchise Fee 50%
- 4) Local Vendor Preference/ Veteran Owned Small Business Preference 5%

The Evaluation Committee will have an opportunity to discuss the firm's proposal. Once the Committee has completed the discussion on the individual the firm, the committee will be asked to take into consideration the criteria listed above and score the proposal according to the percentage allotment afforded to each criteria. See example below. This step will take place for each of the firms. Once all firms have been reviewed, the committee will be given time to finalize their scores for each of the firms. Once the score cards are complete, the City Clerk will tally each evaluator's score card. For each evaluator's score card, the total scores will then be ranked 1-2 with the highest score receiving a 1 and the lowest score receiving a 2. In the event of a tie. The Evaluator will be asked to break the tie and rank the tied vendors according to his interpretation of the information provided to him. The end result will be a separate ranking by each evaluator for all firms listed; no ties on the individual evaluator score cards. Once the scores have been read, an evaluating member of the committee must make a motion, which must be approved by majority vote of the committee.

Evaluation Criteria

	Vendor Name	Qualifications and Capability to Provide Services	Previous Experience	Proposed Franchise Fee	Local Vendor Preference/ Veteran Owned Small Business Preference	Total	Rank	Comments
		Maximum 35%	Maximum 10%	Maximum 50%	Maximum 5%	Maximum 100%		
	Sample	30%	5%	40%	5%	80%	(1-2)	
1	A & B Towing Service	30%	7%	50%	2.5%	89.5%	2	
2	WestWay Towing, Inc.	33%	8%	48%	2.5%	91.5%	1	

Certifier of Score

LISA CHONG

Please Print Name

Date

3/15/18

Li Chong

Signature